



Bradford District Care
NHS Foundation Trust

NHS Workforce Race Equality Standard

Equality Analysis 2020

Compiled by Bo Escritt

NHS Workforce Race Equality Standard (WRES)¹

Introduction

The Workforce Race Equality Standard (WRES) programme was established in 2015. It requires NHS trusts to report against nine indicators of race equality comparing the experiences between white and black and minority ethnic staff. Since the WRES programme in 2015 continued to support improvement driven by data and mandates that NHS trusts produce action plans to tackle the root causes of discrimination. This year's data allows us to continue that process, but also to understand the impact of COVID-19 on BME staff which will become apparent, no doubt, in next year's data.

Throughout this analysis, the term "black and minority ethnic" is used and expressed as the acronym BME, to refer to members of the NHS workforce who are not white. This is largely driven by the data collection process. The definitions of "black and minority ethnic" and "white" used in this analysis have followed the national reporting requirements of ethnic category in the NHS data model and technical guidance and are also used in NHS Digital data. At the time of publication of this guidance, these definitions were based upon the 2001 ONS Census categories for ethnicity.

1) The 9 WRES indicators

Workforce Race Equality Standard (WRES) Indicators



Indicator 1	Indicator 2	Indicator 3	Indicator 4	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Percentage of staff in each of the AFC Bands 1-9 or Medical and Dental subgroups and VSM compared with the percentage of staff in the overall workforce 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Relative likelihood of BME staff being appointed from shortlisting compared to that of white staff being appointed from shortlisting across all posts 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Relative likelihood of BME staff entering the formal disciplinary process, compared to that of white staff entering the formal disciplinary process 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Relative likelihood of BME staff accessing non mandatory training and CPD as compared to white staff 	
Indicator 5	Indicator 6	Indicator 7	Indicator 8	Indicator 9
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> KF 25. Percentage of staff experiencing harassment, bullying or abuse from patients, relatives or the public in last 12 months 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> KF 26. Percentage of staff experiencing harassment, bullying or abuse from staff in last 12 months 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> KF 21. Percentage believing that trust provides equal opportunities for career progression or promotion 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Q17. Percentage of staff experiencing harassment, bullying or abuse from manager/team leader or colleague 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Percentage difference between the organisations' Board membership and its overall workforce

- At the time of the WRES data capture 2020 the Trust employed 3536 staff.
- The survey was completed by 1,144 staff in total, 32% of the work force.
- The trust work force is made up of 885 BME staff which accounts for 25% of all staff.
- 192 BME staff completed the survey. This accounts for 21.69% of the total BME workforce.
- The Trust workforce is made up of 2,449 white staff which accounts for 69.3% of the workforce.
- 996 white staff completed the survey. This accounts for 40.7% of the total white workforce.
- 5.7% of the workforce have not disclosed their ethnicity.
- The recent 2021 WRES data has been inserted for indicators 1-4. All other data refers to 2020 data.

¹ <https://www.england.nhs.uk/about/equality/equality-hub/equality-standard/>

Staff Survey Analysis

2) Indicator 1

Non-Clinical staff

SUPPORT			MIDDLE			SENIOR			VSM		
White	BME	Null/Unknown	White	BME	Null/Unknown	White	BME	Null/Unknown	White	BME	Null/Unknown
68.7%	24.6%	6.7%	80.7%	13.0%	6.2%	87.0%	10.1%	2.9%	66.7%	0.0%	33.3%

Clinical staff

SUPPORT			MIDDLE			SENIOR			VSM		
White	BME	Null/Unknown	White	BME	Null/Unknown	White	BME	Null/Unknown	White	BME	Null/Unknown
62.2%	32.3%	5.5%	77.8%	17.4%	4.9%	78.0%	12.1%	9.8%	-	-	-

Definitions: Support (Bands 1-4), Middle (Bands 5-7), Senior (Bands 8a to 9), VSM -Very Senior Managers 2020 data

- 23% of the workforce at BDCT is from a BME background
- 25% of staff in bands 8a and above, are from a BME background.
- The clinical staff table shows that BME staff are overrepresented at bands 1-4 both tables show that BME staff are under-represented at bands 5-7 and bands 8a to 9.
- BME staff are not represented at all in the very senior managers category.

3) WRES indicators 1 - 9

Indicator Type	WRES Indicator	Metric Description	2016	2017	2018	2019	2020	2021	2020 Benchmark Trusts	2020 National
			Score	Score	Score	Score	Score	Score		
	1	Percentage of BAME staff in VSM		10.4	8.65	12.6	19.48		-	-
	2	Relative likelihood of White applicants being appointed from shortlisting compared to that of BME applicants		0.99	1.15	1.71	2.14	0.97	-	1.61
	3	Relative likelihood of BME staff entering the formal disciplinary process, compared to that of White staff entering the formal disciplinary process		1.98	2.00	1.98	2.64	2.76	1.41	1.16
	4	Relative likelihood of White staff accessing non mandatory training and CPD compared to BME staff	1.00	1.05	1.04	1.00	1.02	1.05	-	1.14
STAFF SURVEY	5	Percentage of staff experiencing harassment, bullying or abuse from patients, relatives or the public in last 12 months.	BME-30%	BME-24.3%	BME-27.7%	BME-29.3%	BME-30.2%	-	BME-28.9%	BME-30.3%
			White-27%	White-28.1%	White-25.2%	White-26.1%	White-20.5%	-	White-25.9%	White-27.9%
	6	Percentage of staff experiencing harassment, bullying or abuse from staff in last 12 months.	BME-23%	BME-24.3%	BME-27.7%	BME-33.09%	BME-25.3%	-	BME-23.4%	BME-28.4%
			White-19%	White-19%	White-20.20%	White-19.83%	White-20.50%	-	White-17.4%	White-23.6%
	7	Percentage believing that trust provides equal opportunities for career progression or promotion.	BME-70%	BME-65.9%	BME-58.4%	BME-58.5%	BME-63.4%	-	BME-69.2%	BME-71.2%
			White-93%	White-85.4%	White-86.7%	White-87.1%	White-87.3%	-	White-87.3%	White-86.9%
	8	In the last 12 months have you personally experienced discrimination at work?	BME-16%	BME-19.1%	BME-17.8%	BME-16.10%	BME-20.1%	-	BME-16.7%	BME-14.5%
			White-5%	White-6.7%	White-5.6%	White-5.2%	White-5.7%	-	White-6.2%	White-6%
BOARD	9	Percentage of BME Board membership	8.30%	10.30%	18.60%	22.80%	22.00%	23.10%		10%

Key: Red indicates an increase in negative experience
Green indicates an increase in positive experience.

4) **Indicator 2**

- The 2021 data shows that white applicants are 0.97 more likely to be appointed than BME applicants. This is a sharp decrease from the 2020 data of white applicants being 2.14 times more likely to be appointed than BME applicants. The 2021 data is promising and is in the range of non-adverse effects.

5) **Indicator 3**

- The 2021 data shows that BME staff are 2.74 times more likely to enter a formal disciplinary process compared to white staff. The data for 2020 was 2.64 times more likely for BME staff.
- The trend of the likelihood of BME staff of entering the formal disciplinary process has been increasing for the past three years previously.
- BDCT likelihood of BME staff entering a formal disciplinary process is higher than the benchmark trusts 2020 figures of 1.41 and the national average of 1.16.
- BDCT likelihood of BME staff entering into a disciplinary formal process is the highest in the region in 2020.

6) **Indicator 4**

- This indicator is in the range of no adverse effect.

7) **Indicator 5**

- The figures in 2020 report 30.2% BME and 20.5% white staff.
- There is a 10.3% gap between the white and BME experience.
- The percentage for BME staff has been increasing year on year since 2017 it decreased slightly in 2019 and increase in 2020.
- There has been a reduction of 5.6% in white staff experience from 2019 – 2020.
- The BME percentage is 1.9% lower than the benchmark trusts and near enough the same as the national average.
- The white staff percentage experience is below the benchmark trusts and 7.4% lower than the national average.

8) **Indicator 6**

- The BME percentage has been steadily rising over the years but has decreased to 21.7% in 2020 a decrease of 4.8% from 2019.
- The white staff experience has decreased slightly by 2.6% from 2019.
- There is a 7.5% difference between the white and BME staff experience.
- The BME BDCT percentage is lower than the benchmark trust and national average BME percentage.
- The BME national average percentage is higher at 28.4% than the BDCT BME percentage.
- The white staff percentage is lower than the trust benchmark and the national average.

9) **Indicator 7**

- 2020 saw a significant increase in BME staff perception as BDCT as an equal opportunity employer from 58.5% in 2019 to 63.4% in 2020. This is an increase of 4.9%.
- The BME percentage is 9.3% below the benchmark trust percentage and is below the BME national average of 71.2%.
- The difference between the white and BME experience at BDCT is 23.9%.
- The white experience has generally been constantly in the 80 percentage range over the years.

- The white staff experience is below the benchmark trusts percentage but the same as the national average.

10)Indicator 8

- The BME experience at 20.1% is about 3.5 times higher than the white experience at 5.7%.
- The BME experience of discrimination has increased by 1.92% from 17.18% in 2019 to 19.1% in 2020.
- The BDCT BME percentage is higher than the benchmark at 15.1% and the national average at 14.5%
- The white experience percentage is below the benchmark trusts but above the national average.

11)Indicator 9

- The representation at board has been increasing year on year more than doubling from 10.30% in 2017 to 22% in 2019. In 2021 the data shows 23.10% which is an increase.
- BME board representation was above the national average of 10% in 2020.
- The board is slightly underrepresented of the BME workforce.

12)Conclusion

When analysing the data we can see some positives with the data moving in the right direction:-

- A significant decrease in the percentage of BME staff experiencing bullying and harassing behaviour from staff.
- A decrease in white staff experience bullying and harassing behaviour from patients and public
- A significant increase in BME staff feeling that BDCT is equal opportunities employer.
- Increase in BME representation on the board.

However, the data shows us that there are stark gaps between the BME and white staff experience at BDCT with BME staff having a worse experience or data is not representative of the BME workforce in indicators 1,3 and 5 - 8.

13)BDCT actions for consideration

It is important to acknowledge that good work is being done to address the disparity in BME experience and representation at BDCT, across the place and ICS.

It is widely recognised that indicators 1-4 are easier to disrupt as these are dependent on process and procedure. Indicators 5 – 8 are cultural and therefore more complex to change and take longer.

In the short-term indicator 3 likelihood of BME staff entering formal disciplinary 2.76 require urgent focus and action at pace.

Recommendation 1

Actions are underway concerning solutions to decrease the disciplinary likelihood of BME 2.76 in more likely for BME staff entering into a formal disciplinary process. A deep dive of the data and monitoring continuously takes place in order to identify hotspots and consider bespoke interventions. The disciplinary policy is being reviewed at present giving an opportunity for further embedding of a just and learning culture.

Recommendation 2

In the longer term the BDCT may consider running an organisational wide campaign, with tools, interventions and support for managers and staff promoting a compassionate, just and learning culture and embedding the Care Trust Way values in all areas of the business.

Recommendation 3

Plans are in development for the overhaul and scrutiny of the recruitment process to eliminate barriers and make it fairer inserting checks and balances.

Data references

BCDT data

Staff survey results 2020 <https://www.nhsstaffsurveys.com/Page/1105/Latest-Results/NHS-Staff-Survey-Results/>

WRES Report 2020 <https://www.england.nhs.uk/wp-content/uploads/2021/02/Workforce-Race-Equality-Standard-2020-report.pdf>

WRES raw data 2020 <https://www.england.nhs.uk/publication/workforce-race-equality-standard-2020-supporting-data/>

