

Recovery and Resilience Cell Senior Leadership Team

Findings from the Corporate
Governance Effectiveness Review

Paul Hogg
Director of Corporate Affairs
July 2019

Survey Overview

- Purpose to **understand changes made** to pre-identified corporate governance meetings in response to the COVID-19 pandemic **to gather learning and innovation.**
- Meetings reviewed were: **Board of Directors; Audit; Finance, Business and Investment; Mental Health Legislation; Quality and Safety Committees.**
- **Range of stakeholders** invited to provide feedback, with a **75% response rate.**
- Questions focused on: **performance reporting; risk management; meeting management; use of technology; flow of information; stakeholder engagement.**
- Survey underpinned by **crisis response matrix**, championed by Professor John Wright.
- Participants asked to reflect whether changes **provided greater or less assurance.**
- Survey split into two sections (Board; sub-committees) – **duplicate findings received.**

WHAT PRACTICE ARE WE SEEING IN COMMUNITIES, INSTITUTIONS, POLICIES?

Understanding crisis-response measures
Collective Sense-making



Findings: Performance Reporting



Bradford District Care
NHS Foundation Trust

Better Assurance Received

- Dynamic systems established to support incident management.
- Concise reporting, clear purpose and recommendation.
- Establishment of Ethics Committee gleaming different view points.
- Executive-led revisions to existing practice (IPR), shared ownership.
- Success achieved by focusing on small changes resulting in big impact.

Less Assurance Received

- Elements of performance reporting felt too 'finance' focused.
- Scrutiny undertaken on broader performance metrics at sub-committees, not always connected through to Board formal reporting.
- Reporting focused on pandemic, risk of unintentional gaps / lack of oversight.
- Temporary pause of internal audit reporting reduced independent assurance.

For Consideration

- Further strengthen 'assurance and escalation' report from sub-committees.
- Strategy delivery to better inform work plans for Board and sub-committees.
- Continued development of the performance management framework to service internal and external requirements – shared ownership. Support dynamic reporting, consider meeting schedule and flow of information.
- Increase different thinking / viewpoints in formal meetings.
- High-level reports with 'reading room' for supporting papers.

Findings: Risk Management



Bradford District Care
NHS Foundation Trust

Better Assurance Received

- Development of COVID-19 specific risk register.
- Proactive external benchmarking undertaken, continued use of external professional networks.
- Pandemic presented opportunities for training refreshers (legislation).

Less Assurance Received

- COVID-19 risk register, Corporate Risk Register (CRR), Board Assurance Framework (BAF) felt disjointed. Champion success of BAF template and format.
- CRR too operational to support strategic discussion.
- Understand progress made on refreshed risk management strategy, and 'risk oversight' being key responsibility of a Board of Directors.

For Consideration

- Further development of the risk management framework to provide foresight to support strategic decision making, part of the refresh of Risk Mngt. Strategy.
- Internal and external learning to feature within sub-committee assurance framework.
- CRR to support Senior Leadership Team framework, connected to the BAF to provide narrative on risks associated with the strategic risks.
- Review training/development requirements for all Board members, enhanced for 'champions'; additional 'opt ins' for specific sub-committees on particular topics.

Findings: Meeting Management



Bradford District Care
NHS Foundation Trust

Better Assurance Received

- Specialist corporate governance provision supporting all corporate governance meetings.
- Enhanced learning and reflection through formal meetings and developments sessions.
- Focussing on immediate priorities created a focused agenda and shared vision, reduced meeting time meant more preparation took place for meeting discussion.
- Good level of 'business as usual' maintained - working together: corporate governance; Non-Executive Directors; and Executive Management Team to co-produce.

Less Assurance Received

- Time pressure of reduced meeting lengths: potentially reduced debate and increased informal discussions outside of formal meeting setting.
- More focused meetings, increased 'mental drain', working at fast pace, and lack of breaks/reflection in meetings and throughout the working day.

For Consideration

- Support development of specialist Corporate Governance Service: focus on embedding Integrated Governance Guide and internal training/development programme; support refresh of work plans; undertaken secretariat function; support well led workstream; support BAF development. Consistency of corporate governance support.
- Care Trust Way methodology to be embedded within meetings.
- Rules of engagement to manage expectations should 'business as usual' continue to be maintained, noting increased pressure/requirements. Commit to realistic meeting times.

Findings: Use of Technology



Bradford District Care
NHS Foundation Trust

Better Assurance Received

- Virtual meetings and events working well, welcomed efficiencies but mindful that sessions may not work for all types of events.
- Build on success of embracing digital working to maximise programmes being used and gain training/support for colleagues.

Less Assurance Received

- Virtual meetings/events not accessible to everyone, avoid unintentional exclusion and meet statutory requirement of holding some 'meetings in public'.
- Blended approach to virtual and face to face meetings/events would be welcomed as a future commitment.

For Consideration

- Trust estate equipped with teleconferencing facilities at key sites.
- Support/guidance from IT on programmes used. Need to understand how large audiences can be accessed and statutory requirement of meeting in public can be better delivered.
- Understand full capabilities of new programmes being used.
- Blended approach to virtual and face to face meetings/events to support agile working.

Findings: Flow of Information



Bradford District Care
NHS Foundation Trust

Better Assurance Received

- Innovations and rapid improvements seen due to focused attention on agreed topics.
- Strong Non-Executive Director involvement throughout the pandemic in key governance processes.
- Shared vision supported co-production and strong engagement across portfolios/directorates.

Less Assurance Received

- On occasion, excessive data and lengthy reports presented that did not support the discussion.
- Developments to be made to strengthen operational meeting structure to provide better line of sight; escalation and assurance routes; visibility and engagement.
- Lack of focus on monitoring delivery for the Trust's overarching strategies.

For Consideration

- Empower operational meeting structure. Develop clear purpose and accountability for all meetings, remove duplication, SLT sighted on potential gaps.
- Embed strategy monitoring within Board and sub-committees.
- Reporting lines from operational meetings to sub-committees to be refreshed.

Findings: Stakeholder Engagement



Bradford District Care
NHS Foundation Trust

Better Assurance Received

- Good participation with a variety of stakeholders, through virtual meetings and planned targeted engagement programmes.
- Good representation of service users and carers through the Learning Week.
- Good examples of partnership working, shared vision and goals.

Less Assurance Received

- Virtual meetings not accessible to everyone, need to fulfil statutory requirements (meetings held in public); provide opportunities to make stakeholders voices heard.
- Challenge on maintaining improvements and innovations made on engaging with stakeholders.
- Supporting Board visibility, and transparency and openness of corporate governance meetings through ongoing engagement with stakeholders and internal marketing.

For Consideration

- Building on successes of target engagement and making meetings/events inclusive.
- CTW methodology to support development of a framework to support more 'listening' and learning throughout the meetings to encourage further opportunities for receiving feedback/stakeholder representation, build on success of Service User/Carer/Staff Experience.
- Embed improved system working and multi-agency approach to support community connector aspirations at Trust.

Care Trust Way – emerging themes



Bradford District Care
NHS Foundation Trust

Maximise inclusion / diversity in **representation**

Focused / **lean** approach / **learn** and remove 'waste'

Build on previous successes / **reflection**

Co-design across different professions / roles

Corporate governance developments = example **case study** of CTW.

Shared focused and problem solving

Internal and external **learning**

Training and **development** opportunities

Clear purpose / roles / responsibilities

Celebrating success

- 1) Support recommendations outlined for consideration, a framework managed by the Corporate Governance Manager will be established.
- 2) Note the development of a specialist Corporate Governance Service and support it to become embedded across the Trust.
- 3) Output report on the findings and next steps will be presented to Board of Directors on 30 July 2020 as part of the well led workstream.
- 4) Support the corporate governance continuous improvements being a Care Trust Way case study to help promote good corporate governance processes that enhance Board visibility and engagement.