

## TRUST BOARD MEETING

22 December 2016

<b>Paper Title:</b>	<b>BME Diversity in Employment Strategy - Six Month Review</b>
<b>Section:</b>	<b>Public</b>
<b>Lead Director:</b>	<b>Sandra Knight, Director of HR &amp; OD</b>
<b>Paper Author:</b>	<b>Fiona Sherburn, Deputy Director of HR &amp; OD</b>
<b>Agenda Item:</b>	<b>10</b>
<b>Presented For:</b>	<b>Discussion</b>

### 1. Purpose of this Report

The purpose of this report is to provide the Board with a further six monthly update on the delivery of the *BME Diversity in Employment Strategy* and the achievements over this period.

The paper also sets out the proposed priorities and actions for 2017 and the impact we expect them to have on the demographic make-up of the workforce.

The Board is asked to note the progress that is being made to deliver the strategy, alongside the challenges and to support the priorities for 2017.

### 2. Summary of Key Points

The BME Diversity in Employment Strategy was ratified in April 2014. To support the delivery of the strategy the Board has agreed a set of metrics and KPIs to measure its impact. This includes the aspirational target of achieving a 35% BME representation within the workforce at all levels, in training and in nominations for the Council of Governors.

In June 2016 the Board was provided with an update on progress to date and an overview of the key priorities for the remainder of 2016, which were as follows. To

- *Promote BME role models,*
- *Develop a support programme for unsuccessful BME job applicants,*
- *Support the delivery of the Board's development around cultural competence,*

- *Support the development of local workforce representation objectives,*
- *Implement the actions identified from the staff survey focus groups as a result of BME staff reporting that they feel that they experience discrimination at work and that they believe that the Trust doesn't provide equal opportunity for career progression and promotion,*
- *Develop an action plan designed to improve the Trust's performance against the Workforce Race Equality Scheme (WRES) 2015 benchmarked report.*
- *Develop and implement cultural competence training for all staff.*

Since the last update (June 2016) the following has been delivered:-

- A further 140 staff have undertaken *cultural competence* training as part of the Engaging Leaders programme. The aim of the session is to help participants have an increased understanding of how to lead diverse teams in an inclusive way that harnesses the skills and talent of everyone.
- BME staff undertaking *developmental opportunities* has increased to 26 percent – which is above the 20 percent target. Actively promoting development opportunities and targeting under-represented groups will continue.
- *Unconscious bias training*, that will be delivered via a train the trainer approach, has been externally commissioned,
- *An action plan* has been developed and approved by the Board to support the Trust's performance against the Workforce Race Equality Scheme (WRES),
- The second wave of the *Moving Forward Programme* commenced in June 2016. In total 21 participants were accepted on to the programme including participants from partner organisations.
- The review of the *staff networks* was completed and a draft action plan developed to address the findings. The action plan, which will be discussed with the Aspiring Cultures Staff Network, will be implemented during 2017, the plan focuses on improving the links between the staff networks and the Trust's strategic agenda as well as clarifying the governance and configuration of the networks and links with partner networks. The plan recommends that there are clear role profiles in place, SMART objectives and training made available to help those undertaking leadership roles within the networks. It is hope that these changes will help strengthen their role and encourage more staff to get involved to deliver on the Trust's strategic agenda.
- Work is underway to *work with business units and directorates to develop recruitment plans* that will support the Trust's aspiration to have a reflective workforce. Key actions include increasing the number of BME apprentices, advertising roles via the local radio and community centres to attract under

represented candidates. The key challenges facing directorates will be the impact of CIPs on recruitment and the shortage of BME staff in professionally qualified roles.

- The Trust has attended *eight job and careers fairs* since August 2016, in line with the academic calendar. This has resulted in a contact list of interested clinical and non-clinical staff who will be targeted with future vacancies at the Trust, and a pipeline of 15 student nurses who will be starting in Staff Nurse roles upon successful completion of their qualifications. Of these student nurses, four are from a BME background.
- The Staff bank team has been building its bank only workforce. Of the 168 staff – 22.60% are from a BME background.

Despite the above actions the percentage of BME staff employed by the Trust has decreased from 21.36 percent on 31<sup>st</sup> March 2016 to 21.04 at 30<sup>th</sup> September 2016, this is due in the main to the number of leavers from a BME background. Over the last 12 months 27 percent of all leavers have been from a BME background. The reasons are being analysed separately for this group of leavers.

The priority for **2017** will be to focus on:-

- *Embedding the unconscious bias training into the Trust's recruitment and selection training and management / leadership development programme,*
- *Implementing the actions identified from the staff focus groups (taking place in late 2016/early 2017) around career progression and discrimination,*
- *Delivering the actions identified in the WRES action plan,*
- *Further enhancing the Moving Forward programme and looking to deliver this in partnership with other Trusts in the West Yorkshire region,*
- *Implementing the action plan to support the staff networks becoming more effective and linked into supporting the Trust's objectives,*
- *Working with Aspiring Cultures to promoting BME role models and communicate the importance of a diverse workforce in achieving the Trust's vision,*
- *Working with Enable 2 to developing a support programme for unsuccessful BME job applicants,*
- *Working closely with Bradford Teaching Hospitals FT to learn from the work they have undertaken to **improve recruitment processes, help BME staff secure internal promotions and the adoption of a long term approach underpinned by a cultural change approach.***

- *Re-engage with leaders and staff on the crucial importance of workforce diversity in achieving our vision and values and agree recruitment plans at business unit and corporate directorate level including use of apprenticeships reviewed at business unit performance meetings*
- *Work with the Leadership Academy to assess organisational readiness for change and facilitate discussions at a local level on cultural barriers - conscious and unconscious that impact on individual understanding and team cohesion.*

### **3. Board Consideration**

The Board are asked to note the progress made to date despite the staff resource pressures, the priorities identified for 2017 and to continue to provide support in the achievement of the BME Diversity in Employment Strategy.

### **4. Financial Implications**

Revenue  Y Capital

There is potential to act commercially and enable the Moving Forward Programme to become self-funding.

### **5. Legal Implications**

The Trust has a duty to take due regard of the Equality Act 2010, this includes the specific duty to

- Eliminate discrimination, harassment, victimization and any other conduct that is prohibited by or under this Act;
- Advance equality of opportunity between persons who share a relevant protected characteristic and persons who do not share it;
- Foster good relations between persons who share a relevant protected characteristic and persons who do not share it.

The NHS Equality Delivery System (EDS) 2 is designed to support NHS Trusts to be compliant with the Equality Act 2010 and the Public Sector Equality Duty. Failure to do so could lead to interaction with the Equality and Human Rights Commission via an inquiry or investigation and if founded an Unlawful Act Notice issued. It can also lead to an employment tribunal or litigation which would have a financial and reputational impact.

## 6. Equality Impact Assessment

The Equality Delivery System Framework in itself is an equality impact assessment. The process includes collecting and analysing data in partnership with service users, carers, staff and partners agreeing objectives and methods of delivery in partnership. The process in 2012 led to the development of the Equality Objectives which include the objective to reduce discrimination for BME staff and job applicants. The BME Diversity in Employment Strategy is a direct output of that work. It has been designed and is being delivered alongside a reference group which is actively equality impact assessing proposals and plans for delivery.

## 7. Previous Meetings/Committees Where the Report Has Been Considered:

Audit Committee	<input type="checkbox"/>	Service Governance Committee	<input type="checkbox"/>	Remuneration Committee	<input type="checkbox"/>	Resources Committee	<input type="checkbox"/>
Executive Management team	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Directors Meeting	<input type="checkbox"/>	Chair of Committee's Meeting	<input type="checkbox"/>	MH Legislation Committee	<input type="checkbox"/>

## 8. Risk Issues Identified for Discussion

These risks were discussed at the June 2016 Board meeting. They remain key risks.

There are a numbers of external and internal obstacles to meeting the 35% aspirational target. These include:-

- low labour turnover in senior roles and corporate directorates, which limits the number of new opportunities for staff,
- high levels of BME labour turnover
- challenging CIP targets which will reduce recruitment opportunities across the Trust,
- potential unconscious bias in recruitment and management

At the June 2016 Board meeting members were asked to consider whether the 35 percent aspirational target is achievable by 2020 or whether a 10 year target should be set. This would be in line with the target and trajectory set by Bradford Teaching Hospitals Foundation Trust. At the time the Board felt it was important to retain the aspirational target. However given the above factors and in particular the on-going financial pressures which will impact on recruitment opportunities the Board is asked to consider the deliverability of this target.

## 9. Links to Strategic Drivers

Patient Experience	Quality	Value for Money	Relationships
A diverse workforce and inclusive leadership that reflect the community it serves delivers better health outcomes and patient experience.		The development and retention of a diverse workforce enables the Trust to optimise this valued resource and avoid unnecessary turnover and recruitment.	The Equality Act 2010 includes the duty to foster positive relationships between people of different groups and promote equality of opportunity. The BME Diversity in Employment Strategy supports compliance with these duties.

## 10. Publication Under Freedom of Information Act

This paper has been made available under the Freedom of Information Act

## 11. Recommendations:

That the Board:

- (a) Note the challenges and progress made to date in delivering the strategy,
- (b) Support the priorities outlined above for 2017 particularly focused on supporting cultural change aimed at making a lasting impact
- (c) Consider the potential to achieve the 35 percent of staff from a BME background by 2020 in light of the operating context and whether the actions proposed are sufficient to support achievement
- (d) Consider whether an annual report may be appropriate rather than a six monthly update given the long term nature of the actions with regular monitoring of progress by the Executive Management Team.

**BME Diversity in Employment Strategy  
Six Monthly Update.  
January 2017**

## **1. Background**

In April 2014 the Board ratified the BME Diversity in Employment Strategy. The strategy was a response to the EDS2 process in 2012 and the follow up externally commissioned study that highlighted differences in BME and White staffs' responses to career related questions in the staff survey and underrepresentation of local BME groups in the workforce generally and particularly in band 7 and above roles in comparison to the working age BME population in Bradford of 35%.

The paper:-

- *outlines the work that is currently underway and the impact that we expect these interventions to have*
- *sets out the key priorities for 2017 and the outcomes expected from this work.*

The board have already received the following information:-

- *The full RAG rated action plan and communications plan that supports this strategy.*
- *The key metrics and KPIs*
- *An overview of the workforce profile*

**The workforce profile** shows that overall there has been a small decrease in the number of BME staff employed by the Trust over the last 12 months. The biggest decrease can be seen in Agenda for Change pay bands 2 and 5 and within Medical staff. The main reasons for this decrease are relocation/change of role and retirements. Over the last 12 months 42 leavers (27.88 %0 out of 151 leavers) were from a BME background. Of these 60 percent worked in a clinical role.

Over the last 12 months there has, however, been an increase in the number of BME staff at band 1 staff employed in the Trust. Fifteen new starters at band 1 (housekeepers) were from a BME background. This represents a 29 percent increase at band 1. This however is typical of the distribution of the BME workforce more generally across all sectors where BME staff tend to occupy lower banded posts with fewer in the higher pay bands which the Trust's strategy aimed to address.

## **2. Key successes**

During the last six months the following have been delivered.

- A further 140 staff have undertaken **cultural competence** training as part of the Engaging Leaders programme. The aim of the session is to help participants have an increased understanding of how to lead diverse teams in an inclusive way that harnesses the skills and talent of everyone.
- BME staff undertaking **developmental opportunities** has increased to 26 percent – which is above the 20 percent target. Actively promoting development opportunities and targeting under representative groups will continue.
- **Unconscious bias training**, that will be delivered via a train the trainer approach, has been externally commissioned,
- **An action plan** has been developed to support the Trust's performance against the Workforce Race Equality Scheme (WRES),
- The second wave of the **Moving Forward Programme** commenced in June 2016. In total 21 participants were accepted on to the programme including a number from partner organisations.
- The review of the **staff networks** was completed and an action plan developed to address the findings. The action plan, which will be implemented during 2017, focuses on improving the links between the staff networks and the Trust's strategic agenda as well as clarifying the governance of the networks so that there are clear role profiles in place, SMART objectives as well as training made available to help those undertaking leadership roles within the networks. It is hope that these changes will help strengthen the role of the networks and encourage more staff to get involved to develop the Trust's strategic agenda.
- Work is underway to work with business units and directorates **to develop recruitment plans** that will support the Trust's aspiration to have a reflective workforce. Key actions include increasing the number of BME apprentices, advertising roles via the local radio and community centres to attract under represented candidates. It is proposed that performance against plan is reviewed at the business unit performance meetings. The key challenges facing business units and directorates will be the impact of CIPs on recruitment and the shortage of BME staff in professionally qualified roles.
- The Trust has attended **eight job and careers fairs since** August 2016, in line with the academic calendar. This has resulted in a contact list of interested clinical and non-clinical staff who will be targeted with future vacancies at the Trust, and a pipeline of 15 student nurses who will be starting in Staff Nurse roles upon successful completion of their qualifications. Of these student nurses, four are from a BME background.

- The Staff bank team have been building its bank only workforce. Of the 168 staff – 22.60% are from a BME background.

This progress has been made against a backdrop of staff resource pressures, however despite the above actions the percentage of BME staff employed by the Trust has however decreased from 21.36 percent on 31<sup>st</sup> March 2016 to 21.04% at 30<sup>th</sup> September 2016, this is due in the main to the number of leavers from a BME background. Over the last 12 months over 27 percent of leavers were from a BME background.

The priorities for the coming year focus on progressing cultural change and challenging cultural norms to improve BME staff retention and experiences at work, re-engaging leaders on the crucial importance of diversity in achieving our goals and re-enforcing our commitment to staff, auditing and improving recruitment processes and developing recruitment plans at business unit and corporate directorate level, leveraging the re-focused Aspiring Cultures Staff Network to support this work.

### **Priorities for 2017**

During 2017 the focus will be on undertaking a small number of interventions that have the potential to make a real difference to the make up the following interventions:-

- Run a series of **focus groups** in early 2017 to understand why overall staff satisfaction by BME staff has fluctuated over the last three years and in partnership with the staff develop a range of appropriate actions to help address the concerns/issues.

A key outcome will be improved staff satisfaction amongst BME staff. This will be measured using data from the annual staff survey.

- Further develop the **Moving Forward Programme** following feedback from cohort 1 and 2 so that a further cohort that will roll-out in June 2017.

The focus will be on recruiting for potential, developing individual confidence and resilience so that the participants feel empowered to apply for new roles and to reach their full potential.

Cohort three will be developed as a system wide programme with participants from the Local Authority, the VCS and local NHS organisations and the plan is to launch it in June 2016.

Key outcomes will be an increase in BME staff securing promotion within the district and an increase in BME staff satisfaction around career progression.

This will be measured by tracking the career of Moving Forward participants and using data from the staff survey.

- A nationally developed e learning training package on **Cultural Competence** has been developed and will be rolled out in 2017. This programme aims to equip line managers with the skills to effectively manage a diverse workforce.

A key outcome will be increased staff satisfaction and a reduction in grievances.

- A training module on **unconscious bias** has been developed and will be embedded in recruitment and selection training as well as the Trust's leadership and management programmes. This work will help ensure managers are more aware of their own biases and how to mitigate them.

A key outcome will be more BME staff appointed to roles at interview and for managers and leaders to be more aware of their own biases and how to manage them. Recruitment and selection data will be used to measure and evaluate the impact of this action.

- A **cultural competence workshop** will be held with the Board and senior managers to ensure they are aware of their own biases and their role in creating a culture in which staff can have open conversations about being misunderstood and inequality.

This should help create a more confident senior management team who are clear about their role in leading and championing this work.

- Work with the Leadership Academy to assess organisational readiness for change and facilitate discussions at a local level on cultural barriers - conscious and unconscious that impact on individual understanding and team cohesion.

This will support greater understanding, compassion and understanding within teams of challenges and needs to support improved relationships and team working.

- Work with Enable 2 to deliver two **workshops for unsuccessful disabled and BME** applicants to help them understand the recruitment processes within the public sector as well as equipping them with good interview skills.

A key outcome will be more BME staff being shortlisted for interview and successful at interview. This will be monitored six monthly using ESR / NHS Jobs data.

- Re-engaging team leaders and staff on the crucial importance of a diverse workforce in achieving our vision and values

This will ensure clarity across the workforce on why workforce diversity is important and senior leadership commitment to supporting achievement

- Work closely with Bradford Teaching Hospitals FT to learn from the work they have undertaken by focusing on a small number of actions to ***improve recruitment processes and help BME staff secure internal promotions.*** The focus has been on a long term strategy to bring about culture change with specific actions including auditing recruitment panels, robust data collection of internal promotion, which is shared with business units; encouraging managers to spot and nurture talent and staff to apply for promotional opportunities. These actions appear to be helping to shift the culture across the Trust.

Learning from this work should help increase the number of BME staff shortlisted for interview and being successful at interview.

### **3. Assurances in Place**

The strategy includes robust action and communications plans which the Board have previously received. It is proposed that the re-focused Aspiring Cultures Network supports re-engagement of leaders and staff across the Trust on the crucial importance of a diverse workforce to achieving our vision and the plans in place to support local as well as corporate actions to bring about change. The Workforce Transformation Steering Group and EMT will continue to monitor the plans with quarterly workforce profile reports continuing to be received by the Board as part of the Integrated Board Performance report. Given the nature of the actions and changes required it is suggested that a report on progress be received annually at the Board

### **4. Financial Implications**

The strategy has been delivered predominately internally using the funded resources within the HR Directorate. External funding had been secured for the Moving Forward Programme through Health Education Yorkshire and the Humber for 2016/17 but this funding will end on 31<sup>st</sup> March 2017.

Options to deliver the programme across Trusts in West Yorkshire to enable it to be self-funding are now being explored. There is real potential for the programme to become part of a whole economy approach to leadership development is part of this exploration which would support the local Sustainability and Transformation Plan (STP)

### **5. Risk Implications**

<b>Risk</b>	<b>Likelihood High/Medium/Low</b>	<b>Implication</b>	<b>Mitigation</b>
Risk to compliance with the Equality Act (2010), performance and reputation if objectives are not met	Low	Medium	Strategy and action plan in place
Reputational risk of noncompliance with the Equality Act (2010) and poor results in the Workforce Race Equality Standard	Medium	Medium	Strategy and action plan in place

## **6. Communication and Involvement**

The BME Diversity in Employment Strategy is a response to the feedback from staff via the career progression study carried out in 2013 and the Equality Delivery System review outcomes the year before.

The on-going development and delivery of the projects is being done in partnership with the Equality and Diversity Reference Group and with input from the BME Staff Network 'Aspiring Cultures'. There is a comprehensive communications plan to support delivery of the strategy; re-engagement of leaders and staff on the importance of a diverse workforce to the achievement of our vision and communication of our plan for 2017 as well as progress to date is proposed.

## **7. Monitoring and review**

The strategy's KPIs, metrics and action plan are monitored quarterly at the Workforce Transformation Steering Group. Workforce Profiles are received quarterly by the Board as part of the Integrated Board Performance Report and six monthly updates are currently received at the Trust Board. The Board may want to consider whether an annual report may be appropriate given the long term nature of the actions described. Regular discussions on progress and direction are held with the BME Staff Network 'Aspiring Cultures'.

## **8. Recommendations**

That the Board:

- (a) Note the challenges and the progress that has been made to date in delivering the strategy,
- (b) Support the priorities outlined above for 2017 particularly focused on supporting cultural change aimed at making a lasting impact
- (c) Consider the potential to achieve the 35 percent of staff from a BME background by 2020 in light of the operating context and whether the actions proposed are sufficient to support achievement
- (d) Consider whether an annual report may be appropriate rather than a six monthly update given the long term nature of the actions with regular monitoring of progress by the Executive Management Team.